



**IFSH**

Institute for Peace Research  
and Security Policy  
at the University of Hamburg



British American Security  
Information Council

**ACA** | Arms Control Association

## **Improving transparency on tactical nuclear weapons: Building blocks for a NATO-Russia dialogue**

17-18 November 2011  
Berlin, Landesvertretung Hamburg

*A roundtable jointly organized by the Arms Control Association (ACA),  
the British American Security Information Council (BASIC), and the Institute for Peace Research  
and Security Policy at the University of Hamburg (IFSH).*

*Funded by the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation  
with support of the German Federal Foreign Office*

NATO's contribution to arms control, nonproliferation and disarmament has been a key issue during discussions on the Alliance's new Strategic Concept and will remain on the agenda of the Deterrence and Defense Posture Review (DDPR). There are disagreements over the role and future of NATO's new WMD Control and Disarmament Committee (WCDC), and the role of the alliance in arms control. While some allies continue to press for steps to reduce the number and salience of tactical nuclear weapons, including through arms control, others express reservations around changes to NATO nuclear policy. They fear that such changes would signal a dilution of US security guarantees to Europe, and embolden Russia. France in particular is concerned about a longer term erosion of allies' faith in and commitment to nuclear deterrence, underlined by greater faith being placed on alternatives such as missile defense. NATO has linked reductions of US nuclear weapons deployed in Europe to reciprocal steps by Russia, though there are competing interpretations about the meaning of reciprocity. The United States is committed to including tactical nuclear weapons (TNW) under a New START-follow on accord and proposed steps to increase transparency on holdings of tactical nuclear weapons. Several NATO nations have advanced similar steps to build confidence between Russia and NATO on tactical nuclear weapons. All of these measures would have an impact on NATO's nuclear posture.

Russia, however, has shown little interest in an arms control dialogue involving TNW at this stage and linked reductions of the role and number of TNW to progress on a range of other security issues, including ballistic missile defense cooperation and discrepancies in conventional capabilities.

Against this background, the seminar will aim to discuss ways to break the stalemate on bringing TNW onto the nuclear arms control agenda. The roundtable will place reductions of the role and number of TNW in the broader context of European security and the relationship between European states and Russia. Experts will also debate proposals to solve the particular political and technical challenges associated with an arms control approach to TNW. The seminar will take place under Chatham House rules.

Questions to be addressed include:

- Are further NATO contributions to the global nuclear non-proliferation and disarmament contingent on an improvement in the relationship with Russia? Do they depend on stronger reassurances to those Central and Eastern European member states concerned about Russian intentions?
- How can arms control play a positive role in strengthening Russia's confidence in its security vis-à-vis NATO, and in strengthening the confidence of central and Eastern European countries in their security vis-à-vis Russia?
- What are the real political, military, technical reasons for the lack of progress on tactical nuclear weapons, and what options are there for overcoming or by-passing these challenges?
- What are the options and practical prospects for addressing tactical nuclear weapons under a New START follow-on accord?
- Are the DDPR and the WCDC significant one-off opportunities or should they be the beginning of a longer process?

## **Programme**

**Thursday, 17 November 2011**

*12:00-13:00 Light Lunch*

*13:00-14:30 Panel 1: The roles of TNW in European security*

- Welcome  
Michael Brzoska, IFSH
- The future of European security and the role of TNW  
Christoph Eichhorn, German Federal Foreign Office
- U.S. and Russian defense policies and TNW: past and future  
Harry Heintzelman, State Department, USA
- U.S. and Russian defense policies and TNW: past and future  
Aleksander Saveliev, IMEMO, Russia

*Chair: Oliver Meier, IFSH*

*14:30-16:00 Panel 2: Addressing TNW under a New START-follow on agreement*

- How keen is Washington really to include TNW under a New START-follow on agreement?  
Ted Seay, USA
- Inducing Russia to bring TNW to the arms control table  
Nikolai Sokov, Monterey Institute of International Studies, USA
- Linkages between NATO's deterrence and defense posture review and US-Russian bilateral arms reductions talks  
Laurens Hogebrink, IKV Pax Christi, Netherlands & Conference of European Churches

*Chair: Götz Neuneck, IFSH*

*16:00-16:30 Coffee*

*16:30- 18:00 Panel 3: Transparency and confidence-building*

- Confidence and security building measures: What is on the table?  
Anne Finger, IFSH
- The role of non-nuclear weapon states in fostering transparency and building confidence  
Jon Erik Strömö, Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Increasing transparency of Russia's TNW: What is possible and when?  
Eugene Miasnikov, Center for Arms Control, Energy and Environmental Studies

*Chair: Paul Ingram, BASIC*

*19:00 Dinner for participants: Invitation by the Deputy Commissioner for Disarmament and Arms Control at the German Federal Foreign Office, Mr. Christoph Eichhorn*

**Friday, 18 November**

*9:00-10:30 Panel 4: Verifying TNW reductions: Obstacles and Opportunities*

- Lessons from New START monitoring and verification  
Harry Heintzelman, USA
- The Baltic Approach: How useful could sub-regional approaches to TNW be?  
Fredrik Lindvall, Swedish Defense Research Agency
- Challenges in the accounting and verification of nuclear warheads  
Andreas Persbo, VERTIC

*Chair: Anne Finger, IFSH*

*10:30-11:00 Coffee*

*11:00-12:30 Panel 5: Improving European security through nuclear arms control*

- Untangling the issues: TNW & missile defense and nuclear arms control  
Götz Neuneck, IFSH
- Real and imagined linkages between TNW & conventional imbalances  
Eugene Miasnikov, Center for Arms Control, Energy and Environmental Studies
- The role of Europe and the United States in fostering progress on TNW  
Paul Ingram, BASIC

*12:30-13:30 Lunch*

*13:30-15:30 Closing panel: Next steps - how can NATO contribute to nuclear disarmament?*

Discussants

- Jacek Durkalec, Polish Institute of International Affairs
- Harry Heintzelman, State Department, USA
- Aleksander Saveliev, IMEMO, Russia
- Oliver Meier, IFSH

###

*Background*

The seminar is one of a series of events on ways to reduce the role of tactical nuclear weapons in European security, organized jointly by ACA, BASIC and IFSH over the last two years, under a joint project supported by the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation. Past roundtables were organized in Ankara, Brussels, Helsinki, Tallinn, Warsaw and Washington. Further seminars are planned in Moscow, Brussels, Paris and Washington before the May 2012 NATO summit. More information on the project and past events can be found at [www.tacticalnuclearweapons.ifsh.de](http://www.tacticalnuclearweapons.ifsh.de).

Contact:

Institute for Peace Research and Security Policy at the University of Hamburg (IFSH)  
Oliver Meier [oliver.meier@ifsh.de](mailto:oliver.meier@ifsh.de)  
Anne Finger [finger@ifsh.de](mailto:finger@ifsh.de)